



Historic Preservation Commission

The Historic Preservation Commission will hold its regular meeting on **Tuesday, July 23, 2024, at 5:30 p.m. in the City Council Chambers of City Hall.** The following will be the agenda for the Regular Meeting:

1. Call to Order
2. Roll Call
3. Swearing in of New Members
4. Approval of Minutes from the June 25th, 2024, Meeting
5. Training Presentation by Planning Director, Brian Frazier
6. Announcement of Vacancies
7. Other Business
8. Adjourn

Historic Preservation Commission Members: Sam Hunt, Simon Lucas, Katherine Mull, Dan O'Malley, Dan Rink, Ernest K. Sills, Adam Oakley, Brett Shoemaker

Youth Council Advisory Member: Kate Bridges

Historic Preservation Commission
Tuesday, June 25, 2024, 5:30 pm

A regular meeting of the City of Hickory's Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) was held on Tuesday, June 25, 2024 at 5:30 pm, in Council Chambers of the Julian G. Whitener Municipal Bldg.

Members Present: Katherine Mull, Dan Rink, Sam Hunt, Dan O'Malley, Adam Oakley, and Ernie Sills

Members Excused: Simon Lucas and Brett Shoemaker

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Senior Planner Mike Kirby, staff liaison; Planning Director Brian Frazier; and Minutes Clerk Anne Starnes

A quorum was present.

Call to Order: Katherine Mull, Chair, called the meeting to order at 5:35 pm.

Roll Call: Mr. Kirby said a quorum was present, and Simon Lucas and Brett Shoemaker were excused.

Administration of the Oath of Office: Commission members Sam Hunt, Adam Oakley, and Ernie Sills were recently re-appointed and took the City's oath of office. New member Brett Shoemaker will be sworn in when he attends his first meeting. Mr. Kirby said Mr. Oakley would now represent the Building Trades Profession category on the Commission, and Mr. Shoemaker will serve as an At-Large member.

Approval of March 26, 2024 Minutes: Minutes of the previous meeting in March were distributed in advance. No additions, deletions, or corrections to the minutes were stated. Sam Hunt moved, seconded by Dan O'Malley, to approve the March 26, 2024 minutes as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

Public Hearing to Consider Certificate of Appropriateness 24-02: Ms. Mull reviewed how quasi-judicial public hearings are conducted, saying all persons presenting evidence must be sworn in prior to their testimony and members of the audience may speak only from the podium. She said any member with a known conflict of interest regarding the proceedings should state so and ask to be recused from participating.

At their recent training session, Mr. Rink said members were advised to be transparent and acknowledge driving by the subject property, as he did prior to this hearing. Mr. Kirby said yes, that driving by a property did not present a conflict of interest; however, members should avoid stopping to walk around the property. He plans to hold a quasi-judicial training session for the Commission soon.

None of the members stated a known conflict of interest.

Ms. Mull opened the public hearing.

The clerk swore in all speakers prior to their testimony.

Mike Kirby presented the Staff Report and referred to PowerPoint slides. He reviewed **slide #2** (Certificate of Appropriateness 24-02).

Certificate of Appropriateness 24-02

- **Property Location:** 401 3rd Avenue NE

- **Applicant:** Scott and Hailey Lail
- **Owner:** Scott and Hailey Lail
- **Property Name:** George W. Hall House
- The property is located in the Claremont Local Historic District.

Slide #3 (Property History)

The George W. Hall House is a two-story frame dwelling of Neo-Classical Revival design built in 1906. A two-story central portico with a pediment cornice and Scamozzi capitals dominate the three-bay façade. Other notable features include doors and windows with segmented arched transoms, a hipped and gabled roof with three original chimneys, and one added in the 1980s. The house is located in the Claremont Historic District.

Slide #4 (Property History - Photograph). Mr. Kirby said the photo shows the front of the property, as seen from the driveway.

Slide #5 (Aerial Map). The overhead photo shows the location on 3rd Avenue NE, near Main Avenue.

Slide #6 (Nature of the Request).

The applicant has requested approval to add a free-standing carriage house, a screened porch to the existing non-historic portion of the house, fencing and a pool.

Slide #7 (Current Conditions – Photograph). Mr. Kirby said the photo shows the rear of the home, where the proposed screened porch will be located.

Slide #8 (Current Conditions – Photograph). Mr. Kirby said the photo shows the rear yard. The fencing can be seen, and part of the driveway.

Mr. Kirby reviewed **slides #9-14** (Statutory Analysis).

- 1) Height.
 - The screened porch and carriage house will both be one-story in height.
- 2) Setback, lot coverage, yards, orientation and positioning of the building, and spacing of buildings.
 - The overall lot coverage will increase by approximately 1634 square feet. The existing building footprint will increase by approximately 1634 square feet.
 - The screen porch addition will follow the existing rectangular shape of the existing home and will be approximately 300 square feet in total area. This will be an addition connected to the main house and located at the rear of the home.
 - The carriage house addition will be oriented towards the main house but will also feature windows to the rear. The carriage house will remain closely located to the side property line and be within 20 feet of the main house.
 - The pool addition will be approximately 336 sq ft. and be located to the rear of the property.
3. Materials, surface textures and patterns.
 - The screened porch addition will be constructed of wood and will be clad in brick veneer and lap board. According to the applicant, the brick veneer chosen will closely match the house. The applicant informed staff that the windows were chosen to match the originals. No patterns or textures were noted.
 - The carriage house will be constructed of wood, lap board, and brick veneer. According to the applicant, this will closely match the existing house.
 - The pool will consist of concrete with bluestone paving. A stone veneer wall will separate the pool from the rear property
4. Architectural detailing.
 - The screened porch addition will incorporate the Neo-Classical Revival design details and will not impact any known architectural details associated with the house.

- The carriage house will incorporate design details of the main house and will not impact any known architectural details associated with the house
- 5. Roof shapes, forms, and materials.
 - The new addition will have a hip roof with sloping sides and appropriate pitch. The roof material will be fiberglass shingles. The applicant noted the roof materials would closely match those on the house. No equipment or special features were noted.
- 6. Fenestration proportions, shapes, position and location, and pattern.
 - The carriage house will have multiple windows. Placement varies depending on elevation. Windows will match the existing home.
- 7. General form and proportions of buildings and structures.
 - The screened porch and carriage house will be Neo-Classical Revival in shape and will be one story. The existing house is two stories.
- 8. Appurtenant features and fixtures including, but not limited to, lighting, walls, and fences.
 - An 8-foot wood fence to be added to the rear and sides of the property. A stone retaining wall will be added to right hand side of the property, along the driveway.

Slide #15 (Site Plans). Mr. Kirby said the architect provided this rendering, showing the rear of the property as it will appear after the screened porch and pool are added.

Mr. Kirby reviewed **slide #16** (Site Plans) and explained where the carriage house, screened porch, pool area, retaining wall, and wood fence would be located on the property.

Slide #17 (Site Plans). Mr. Kirby said the elevation drawing showed the proportions of the carriage house and appearance of the final product.

Mr. Kirby reviewed **slide #18** (Site Plans), saying it was a detailed landscaping plan for the property.

Mr. Kirby reviewed **slide #19** (Staff Analysis).

- The carriage house will be located to the rear side of the house. The screened porch will be to the rear of the home. However, the addition will not encroach into the 10-foot side setback required in an R-3 residential zone.
- The overall lot coverage will increase by approximately 1634 square feet. The existing building footprint will increase by approximately 1634 square feet.
- The carriage house and porch addition will follow the existing Neo-Classical Revival shape of the existing home and will be approximately 1298 square feet in total area. This will be proportional to the main home's 1,492 square foot footprint. Although there are no stated guidelines regarding height and proportionality, the highest point of the carriage house is approximately 15 feet, which is about 7 feet less than the two-story home.
- As previously discussed, the exterior of the carriage house shall consist of wood and lap board finishes, along with fiberglass shingles, which meets Guideline 2.5.4. The structure will also have to include windows on three sides of the structure.
- As such, staff recommends approval of the petition as proposed.

Mr. Kirby asked for questions from members.

Mr. Sills asked if a permit was required to install a pool. Mr. Kirby said yes, since it is considered an accessory structure.

There were no additional questions, and Ms. Mull thanked Mr. Kirby.

The Staff Report was entered into the record as Exhibit A.

Ms. Mull said persons in favor of the petition would speak first during the hearing, followed by the opponents.

PROPONENTS

· **Scott Lail**, 401 3rd Avenue NE, Hickory NC, addressed the Commission, saying he was present to answer any questions from members. He said the property drops off significantly between the road and where the new carriage house will be located, approximately 15-feet, so the carriage house will not be very visible from the street. He said the project would also help with some current drainage issues they have on either side of the house, noting the concrete drive is starting to buckle and there is about 3-4 inches of separation between the slabs.

Ms. Mull asked about their project timeline, and Mr. Lail said they hope it will be completed by this time next year.

There were no further questions for Mr. Lail from members, and Ms. Mull thanked him.

No additional proponents were present.

OPPONENTS

No opponents were present.

Ms. Mull asked if there were any additional questions for staff, and there were none. There was no further discussion among the members.

Ms. Mull declared the public hearing was closed.

First motion

Dan Rink moved, seconded by Dan O'Malley, that the Historic Preservation Commission finds as fact the proposed project at 401 3rd Avenue NE is congruent with the character of the district, because the statutory criteria of height, setback and placement, materials, architectural detailing, roof, fenestration, general form and proportions of the buildings or structures and appurtenant features and fixtures, are generally in harmony with the special character of the neighboring properties and the district as a whole, for the following reasons: the carriage house will be located near the rear of the house; the screened porch will be to the rear of the house, but within the required 10-foot setback; the overall lot coverage will increase by 1,634 sq ft, as will the existing building footprint; the carriage house and porch addition will follow the Neo-Classical Revival design of the existing home and will be in proportion to it; although there are no guidelines regarding height, the carriage house height will be 15-feet, which is about 7-feet less than the 2-story home; and the carriage house exterior will consist of wood, lap board, and brick veneer to closely match the house, and will include windows that match the house.

The motion carried unanimously.

Second motion

Dan Rink moved, seconded by Ernie Sills, that the Commission, based on the previously adopted findings of fact, approve Certificate of Appropriateness 24-02 as proposed. The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Mull said Certificate of Appropriateness 24-02 had been granted. She thanked Mr. and Mrs. Lail for attending.

Announcement of Vacancies: Mr. Kirby said the only HPC vacancy is for a Historic Properties member. He will announce it on social media, which proved helpful recently in finding a new member. Ms. Mull also plans to speak with someone who might be interested.

Other Business:

- Mr. Kirby said Ms. Mull contacted him regarding the windows currently being replaced on a home in the Oakwood Historic District. The property is located on the corner of 3rd Avenue and 5th Street NW, and about three houses east of her home. Yesterday she witnessed wood windows being hauled away from the property and had contacted Mr. Kirby. He has since visited the property and said the windows being removed were aluminum, and not original to the house; however, original wood windows currently exist on the basement level of the house. He said replacement windows typically used on historic homes are made of a wood composite, not vinyl. The most

recent photos in his files are from the 1970s, and he had no information on the age of the windows when the current owner purchased the home.

Ms. Mull said she and other neighbors have concerns about the new windows, which appear to be very different from the original ones. She asked what process is used to evaluate new windows. Mr. Kirby said staff references the design guidelines, and read aloud from the City's Design Guidelines for Exterior Windows regarding repair and replacement. He said they specifically state "should be," not "shall be," noting that it would cost thousands of dollars to have individual windows constructed to match what was previously on a historic house. He referenced the Commission's recent training session in March, when members had discussed using alternative materials.

Mr. Rink asked if a homeowner was required to apply for a building permit to replace windows. Mr. Kirby was not certain, but did not think so. Ms. Mull suggested other members go by and view the house under discussion.

Regarding minor reviews, Mr. Oakley asked if it was appropriate to request a second opinion from Commission members, even if only to ensure that a historic appearance was maintained. Mr. Kirby said minor COAs are reviewed and decided by staff, and not brought before the Commission.

- Members discussed the large house at the intersection of 3rd Avenue NE and Highway 127, directly across from the SALT Block. The property owner is currently building a fence with rock columns, and a question was raised about the appropriateness of the materials being used for it. Mr. Kirby referenced the City's Design Guidelines for Fences, which say brick, stone, cast iron, or wood are recommended, and the homeowner had advised him that he wanted to build stone columns with wrought iron fencing between them. Ms. Mull understood that it was within the guidelines, but in her opinion, it was incongruous with adjacent properties and the home's brick foundation. Mr. Kirby offered to go by and discuss the columns with the homeowner, but said the City now has limited enforcement power. Member comments included that the small details are what gives these homes their historic appearance, and without the small details, it is just a box, so the small details are very important.

- Mr. Kirby said the Commission had met the State's requirements as a Certified Local Government (CLG), but only one member had submitted their form to him following the previous training.

- Mr. Rink said members were previously kept updated on all minor COAs, with a list included in their agenda packet for discussion with staff. He requested Mr. Kirby provide a list of minor COAs to members in the future.

- Mr. Kirby plans to hold another training session for members soon.

- Members discussed their future meeting schedule. Mr. O'Malley said meetings were held more frequently in previous years, and most of the members were willing to meet more often.

Next Meeting: Meetings are typically held at 5:30 pm on the fourth Tuesday of the month at City Hall. Members will be advised by e-mail of their next meeting.

Adjourn: Ernie Sills moved, seconded by Dan Rink, to adjourn. There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:15 pm.

Katherine Mull, Chair
Historic Preservation Commission

Anne Starnes, Minutes Clerk
City of Hickory